# Pioneer independent orbit determination

#### Rationale

 Independent confirmation of anomalous acceleration

 More importantly: Ability to do precision orbit determination that incorporates telemetry-based estimation of on-board forces (or other theories!)

## **Orbit estimation**

• Simple orbit estimation program (C++, some FORTRAN libraries)

- Modular construction: separate front-end, use of well-known libraries
- Uses JPL SPICE library for solar system ephemerides
- Takes into account current and historical DSN station positions
- Uses MINPACK for nonlinear least squares estimation
- Simple fast integrator (Stoermer's rule with predictor-corrector algorithm)
- Takes into account relativistic Doppler and Shapiro time delay
- Uses relativistic equations of motion for spacecraft position
- Includes corrections due to oblateness of Jupiter and Saturn
- Includes simple troposphere and solar corona model
- Includes simple (Earth-pointing flat plate) solar pressure model
- Uses custom library to read Doppler and ramp data from ODFs
- Maneuvers estimated as changes in velocity along spin axis
- Custom library reads telemetry for maneuvers, spin, and on-board generated heat

#### • JPL HORIZONS used for initial Pioneer 10/11 state estimates

#### **Orbit estimation**





## **Estimating on-board forces**

- Basic concept: in addition to "solving for" orbital elements, also solve for linear factors  $(q_i)$  of thermal acceleration. Equation of motion modified with thermal acceleration  $a = (1/mc)\Sigma q_i P_i$  where the  $P_i$  are known from telemetry.
- Method relies on no a priori assumptions about geometry, only about linearity and spin
- Most "correct" method from a modeling/statistical perspective

## Estimating on-board forces

🗽 sc23_2446765-2450003-Q.odp - ODP 📃								
<u>F</u> ile <u>E</u> dit <u>⊂</u> ompu	Eile Edit Computation View Help							
] 🗅 🖻 🖬   %								
State Accelerat	ion 🛛 Maneuvers 🗍 R	Rad. Press. Teler	netry Doppler A	Accuracy 🗍 DSS Xmt	🛛 DSS Rov 🗍 Medi	a Results		
Elec file name:	cuments\NASA\PIC		data\23elec_edited	.dat Browse				
Comm file name:	ents\VIKTOR\PION	VEER\DOPPLER\da	ta\23comm_edited	.dat Browse				
RTG initial power:	0570.170	Deter La	0101000100					
measured on (1D):	25/6.1/9		0.0121606162					
incusarea on (50).	2441499.5		1.3644533078:	Qind. [0.5				
2								
L								
1								
					·			
		-		-	her growthere			
87	88 81	9 90 '	91	92 93	94	95 96		
-1								
-2								
Chi2 = $35211421.6$	6818 (status = 0) [1	.503 data points.]						

#### Solar model



#### Solar model

Elle Edit   Computation Maneuvers   Rad. Press. Telemetry   Doppler Accuracy   DSS Xmt DSS Rcv   Media Results     Sate   Sate   1   87   88   89   90   91   92   93   94   95	DP	•	p - ODI	13.od	=6.5e-	3-aP=	5000:	65-24	167	_244	23_	sc23	Tie :
State Acceleration   Maneuvers Rad. Press.   Telemetry Doppler   Accuracy DSS Xmt   DSS Rev Media   Results     Solar model     Satistic     Satistic <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>elp</td><td>ω <u>Η</u>ε</td><td>n <u>V</u>ie</td><td>putation</td><td>omp</td><td>it <u>⊂</u>o</td><td><u>E</u>dit</td><td>jle <u>E</u>o</td><td>File</td></t<>					elp	ω <u>Η</u> ε	n <u>V</u> ie	putation	omp	it <u>⊂</u> o	<u>E</u> dit	jle <u>E</u> o	File
State       Acceleration       Maneuvers       Red. Press.       Telemetry       Doppler       Accuracy       DSS Rcv       Media       Results         Solar model       Sa:       1       Se:       0.98       Ss:       0.5         Sa:       1       Se:       0.98       Ss:       0.5         2       .       .       .       .         1       .       .       .       .         87       88       89       90       91       92       93       94       95       96         -1       . </td <td>?</td> <td></td> <td>? <b>\?</b></td> <td>5</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>X 🖻</td> <td></td> <td>; 🔒</td> <td>È</td> <td>🗅 🖻</td> <td></td>	?		? <b>\?</b>	5				X 🖻		; 🔒	È	🗅 🖻	
Solar model         Sa:       1         Sa:       1         2       .         1       .         87       88         89       90         91       92         92       93         94       95         96       .         -1       .         -2       .	lemetry Doppler Accuracy DSS Xmt DSS Rcv Media Resu	netry 🛛 Dopple	Telen	Press.	Rad.	ivers	Maneu	ation	elera	Accel	e   /	State	Sta
Set       1       Set       0.98       Sst       0.5         2       .       .       .       .       .         1       .       .       .       .       .         87       88       89       90       91       92       93       94       .       95       .         -1       .       <									odel	ar moo	Solar	⊡ So	
	0.5	0.5	Ss:	_	8	0.98	Se:	_			1	Sa: [	Sa
		0.0	I		•	10.00					Ŀ		
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·											2	2
												1	1
	and the second s	-							-				
	91 92 93 94 95	91	90 )		89		88		7	87			
												-1	- 1
												-	
												-2	-2
Cni2 = 350495564.7375 (status = 0) [1503 data points.1.	].		oints.1	data n	)[1503	s = 0	(statu	4.7375	9564	350495	: 35	ni2 =	L Chi2

### **DSN** stations

- Pioneer data spans over 30 years
- During this period, many DSN stations have been
  - commissioned
  - decommissioned
  - moved

 Published data sets usually contain only current stations

#### **DSN** stations

<b>sc23_24467</b> 6	55-2450003	-aP=6.5e-1	3.odp - OD	Р					
<u>File E</u> dit <u>C</u> omp	utation <u>V</u> iew	v <u>H</u> elp							
	X 🖻 💼	▶ 🔳 🧯	∋ ? <b>№</b> ?						
Image: Serie Sector									
C D55-28 (3									
87 -1 -2	88	89	90 2	91	92	93	94	95	96
For Help, press F1									

#### Maneuvers

- Attitude correction maneuvers are not supposed to change velocity; any velocity change is small and random (due to timing uncertainties, thruster alignment, etc.)
- Velocity changes perpendicular to the spin axis likely cancel each other as the spacecraft rotates
- Doppler observable not sensitive to such velocity changes anyway
- Instead of modeling each attitude correction as a three-dimensional maneuver, it is modeled as a velocity change along the Earth-spacecraft line, reducing the number of parameters to be estimated by a factor of three

#### Maneuvers

<b>sc23_2446765-2450003-a</b>	P=6.5e-13.odp	- ODP						
Eile Edit ⊆omputation ⊻iew	<u>E</u> ile <u>E</u> dit <u>C</u> omputation <u>V</u> iew <u>H</u> elp							
State Acceleration Maneuver	rs Rad. Press.	Telemetry Doppler	Accuracy DSS Xmt	DSS Rcv Media	Results			
Maneuvers								
Read nuke file 2446780,980 -4,1958882035E-007								
	2446932 980	-1.4300920900E-000	5					
	2446960.855	1.0776189783E-005						
	2447139.480	-5.4750216708E-006	;					
Edit	2447301.459	-9.9264197934E-008	3					
Latorr	2447348.084	-2.1787619936E-006	5					
Add	2447485.521	-9.1261999686E-007	,					
Delete	2447526.667	-1.5131082417E-006	, <u> </u>	1				
Delete	244/68/.8/6	2.6198245257E-006						
	2447877.021	-9.4923749964E-007	,					
	2448069.105	5.2928278433E-006						
	2448094.251	4.8477335058E-006						
	2448446.313	1.0117438274E-006	· · · · · ·	1				
I	0440000 40F	4 0070/0005/5 00/		-				
_								
2			•					
1								
			· .					
				·				
	- <u></u>		Sec. 1	i				
87 88	89 9	0 91	92 93	94 9	5 96			
-1								
-2			•					
For Help, press F1								
r or r op) pross r 1								

#### Data sets

- I had two data sets available:
- "JPL2002" certified data set used in the 2002 JPL study, containing:
  - Nearly 11 years of Pioneer 10 data (~9 years usable; last ~2 years use different encoding)
  - Nearly 5 years of Pioneer 11 data
- "Jacobson" uncertified data set containing:
  - ~75 days of data surrounding Pioneer 10 Jupiter encounter, ~67 days a year later
  - Nearly 2 years of data leading up to, and including, Pioneer 11 Saturn encounter

## Using data sets

- "Early" data not yet certified, but it can be used to
  - Validate orbit determination code
  - Verify/calibrate solar model

"Late" (certified) data set can be used to
(Re)-determine the value of a<sub>P</sub>
Test the "thermal hypothesis"

#### Some problems

- "Ku-band" data
- Sky frequency
- "Banding" when ramp data not used
- Block 5 data reference frequency
- Motion of Earth station during Doppler count interval
- Timekeeping

## Some problems

<b>xc23_2446765-24500</b> 0	3-QaP.odp - ODP						
<u>File E</u> dit <u>C</u> omputation <u>V</u> iew <u>H</u> elp							
🗋 D 🖻 🔚 🕺 🛍 💼	🕨 🔳 🗇 🤋 🎀						
State Acceleration Mane	uvers Rad. Press. Telemetry Dop	pler Accuracy DSS Xmt DSS R	tov Media Results				
	4\PIONEER\DOPPLER\data\86334o973	43_sc23.odf  Browse					
Minimum Doppler duration:	0 Hz Read every	5 th record					
Maximum Doppler duration:	86400 Hz Frequency file	ter: 5 Hz					
Filter window size:	10 Filter value:	0 sigma					
005							
ODF record types		-way Doppler					
Divide-by-96" reference	ce frequency encoding	way Doppler					
Ku-band" reference fre	equency encoding	way Doppler					
-2							
		•					
- 1							
		· ·					
87 88	89 90 91	92 93 94	4 95 96				
-1							
<sup>-</sup> -2		•					
Chi2 = 35303471.4857 (statu	ıs = 2) [1503 data points.] .						

### Model validation

- Planetary encounter requires
  - Accurate orbit integration
  - Modeling of satellites
  - Relativistic equations of motion
  - Oblateness model

 Rapid change in spacecraft velocity stresses the model, allowing one to uncover subtle errors

### **Model validation**

- Planetary encounter not perfectly modeled; discrepancy due to
  - Not modeling the changing velocity of the spacecraft during Doppler interval
  - Not modeling planetary thermal radiation pressure
- Mismodeling is very similar for the two encounters

#### Pioneer 10 Jupiter encounter mismodeling

- Mismodeling magnitude ~5 Hz (~30 40 cm/s)
- Mismodeling limited to ~2 day period surrounding closest approach



#### Pioneer 11 Saturn encounter mismodeling

- Mismodeling magnitude ~5 Hz (~30 40 cm/s)
- Mismodeling limited to ~2 day period surrounding closest approach



### Solar model validation

• Simple 3-parameter flat plate model (for now) modeling absorption, diffuse and specular reflection

	α	$\delta$	σ
Nominal	1.00	0.98*	0.50
Pioneer 10	1.00	0.77	0.56
Pioneer 11	0.95	1.34	0.43

 Similarity between Pioneer 10 solution (<5 AU) and nominal values increases confidence that solar model is valid and orbit determination code works reliably

\*Published reflectance of 0.79 is assumed to be "net" reflectance, from this and emittance figures, an effective reflectance of 0.96 is calculated. Results presented here used the figure of 0.98 (a result of a prior calculation); the difference between the two is negligible.

## Solving for $a_P$

- Solution appears highly dependent on initial value (least squares optimization finds local minima near initial value; acceleration absorbed by maneuvers)
- The goodness of fit (χ<sup>2</sup>) is similar in all cases

 Therefore, I cannot say that a particular value of a<sub>p</sub> is "the" solution, only that it is consistent with the data

## Solving for $a_P$



## Solving for $a_P$

• All values in units of  $10^{-13}$  km/s<sup>2</sup>:

Data set	Initial value:	0	10	6.5
"2002"	Pioneer 10	4.77	8.06	8.26
2002	Pioneer 11	-0.15	7.38	5.84
"Jacobson"	Pioneer 11	-0.29	9.55	5.99

- Conclusions so far (this is work in progress!): much depends on the choice of initial values and the least squares algorithm
- Same near constant acceleration consistent with all studied data sets

## Solving for $a_P$ and $q_i$

- Simultaneously solving for constant acceleration and thermal coefficients
- Initial thermal values are nominal:  $q_{\rm RTG} = 0.01, q_{\rm elec} = 0.35$
- Two different initial accelerations used:

Initial $a_P$ (10 <sup>-13</sup> km/s <sup>2</sup> )	$a_P$	$q_{ m RTG}$	$q_{ m elec}$
0	0.15	0.012	0.36
4	2.05	0.010	0.36

#### • After obtaining initial solution:

- Divide data into 60-day (120-day) batches
- Propagate solution through batches, solving for only
  - $\circ a_P$
  - Maneuvers

#### Used 9-year Pioneer 10 data set



 Some annual periodicity is also visible in least squares solution (error in Shapiro code?)



#### Same signature not apparent in Pioneer 11 data set



Pioneer Explorer Collaboration Second ISSI Meeting, Bern, Switzerland, February 19-23 2007 Copyright © 2007 Viktor T. Toth http://www.vttoth.com/ 29

## Plans (February 2007)

- Develop proper three-dimensional radiation pressure model using raytracing code
- Improve orbit determination code:
  - Improve flyby modeling accuracy
  - Solar and planetary radiation model
  - Ionospheric propagation delay
- Incorporate means to estimate acceleration (and jerk term!) in other directions (Earth-pointing, and along the direction of motion)
- Improve attitude and maneuver modeling
- Improve pointing information using AGC or SNR
- Improve data weighing, filtering, etc. capabilities
- FIND AND FIX BUGS!
- Utilize new Doppler data when available

#### **Thank You!**

Pioneer Explorer Collaboration Second ISSI Meeting, Bern, Switzerland, February 19-23 2007 Copyright © 2007 Viktor T. Toth http://www.vttoth.com/ 31